

**PROCEEDINGS OF THE COLUMBUS
CONFERENCE FOR GOOD CITY
GOVERNMENT AND FIFTH
ANNUAL MEETING OF THE NATIONAL
MUNICIPAL LEAGUE HELD NOVEMBER
16, 17, 18, 1899**

Published @ 2017 Trieste Publishing Pty Ltd

ISBN 9780649681600

Proceedings of the Columbus Conference for Good City Government and Fifth Annual Meeting of the National Municipal League Held November 16, 17, 18, 1899 by Clinton Rogers Woodruff

Except for use in any review, the reproduction or utilisation of this work in whole or in part in any form by any electronic, mechanical or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including xerography, photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, is forbidden without the permission of the publisher, Trieste Publishing Pty Ltd, PO Box 1576 Collingwood, Victoria 3066 Australia.

All rights reserved.

Edited by Trieste Publishing Pty Ltd.
Cover @ 2017

This book is sold subject to the condition that it shall not, by way of trade or otherwise, be lent, re-sold, hired out, or otherwise circulated without the publisher's prior consent in any form or binding or cover other than that in which it is published and without a similar condition including this condition being imposed on the subsequent purchaser.

www.triestepublishing.com

CLINTON ROGERS WOODRUFF

**PROCEEDINGS OF THE COLUMBUS
CONFERENCE FOR GOOD CITY
GOVERNMENT AND FIFTH
ANNUAL MEETING OF THE NATIONAL
MUNICIPAL LEAGUE HELD
NOVEMBER 16, 17, 18, 1899**

Proceedings
OF THE
COLUMBUS CONFERENCE
FOR
Good City Government
AND
FIFTH ANNUAL MEETING
OF THE
NATIONAL MUNICIPAL LEAGUE

HELD NOVEMBER 16, 17, 18, 1899

CLINTON ROGERS WOODRUFF, EDITOR

PHILADELPHIA
NATIONAL MUNICIPAL LEAGUE
1899

Dec. 14 1921
HARVARD UNIVERSITY
The Library of the Schools
of Landscape Architecture and City Planning
Gift of B. Phay
Sam. Collection S. S. Phay

NATIONAL MUNICIPAL LEAGUE 1921

OFFICERS

President, JAMES C. CARTER, New York.
First Vice-President, CHARLES RICHARDSON, Philadelphia.
Second Vice-President, SAMUEL B. CAPEN, Boston.
Third Vice-President, THOS. N. STRONG, Portland, Ore.
Fourth Vice-President, H. DICKSON BRUNS, New Orleans.
Fifth Vice-President, EDMUND J. JAMES, Chicago.
Secretary, CLINTON ROGERS WOODRUFF, Philadelphia.
Treasurer, GEORGE BURNHAM, JR., Philadelphia.

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

CHARLES J. BONAPARTE, *Chairman*,
216 St. Paul St., Baltimore.

GEORGE W. GUTHRIE, Pittsburg.	WILLIAM G. LOW, Brooklyn.
JOSEPH A. MILLER, Providence.	HARRY A. GARFIELD, Cleveland.
OLIVER McCLINTOCK, Pittsburg.	DUDLEY TIBBITS, Troy.
GEORGE W. OCHS, Chattanooga.	JOHN A. BUTLER, Milwaukee.
HECTOR McINTOSH, Philadelphia.	FRANK N. HARTWELL, Louisville.

AND THE OFFICERS.

OFFICE OF THE SECRETARY:
GIRARD BUILDING, PHILADELPHIA.

INTRODUCTION.

The leading papers published in this volume on the "Municipal Program," and the draft of the proposed Constitutional Amendments, and the Municipal Corporations Act form the final report of the Committee appointed at the Louisville meeting of the National Municipal League in May, 1897. This Committee was directed "to report on the feasibility of a municipal program which will embody the essential principles that must underlie successful municipal government, and which shall also set forth a working plan or system, consistent with American industrial and political conditions, for putting such principles into practical operation; and such Committee, if it finds such Municipal Program feasible, is instructed to report the same, with its reasons therefor, to the League for consideration."

This the Committee did, presenting its preliminary report to the Indianapolis meeting in November, 1898, and its final report, which was formally and unanimously accepted (see page 45) at the Columbus meeting in November, 1899. Accompanying the first report were four principal papers prepared by members of the Committee, which, in turn, were discussed in nine subsidiary papers. Accompanying the final report were four more principal papers, likewise discussed in subsidiary

papers, all of which are published in this volume, together with the perfected draft of the Amendments and Act.

The reports of the Committee, with the papers and the drafts, practically constitute the Municipal Program. It is presented to the students of American municipal government by the National Municipal League, as a contribution to the subject, representing nearly three years of patient study by a group of men of diverse training and views, selected without reference to party affiliation.

If we may be permitted to speak of the importance of this contribution, its reception at the hands of American publicists is gratifying, and indicates clearly the need for such a piece of work and the deep interest in the cause of better municipal government in America. With scarcely a notable exception, the press have commended the Committee's endeavor, and its recommendations have met with a most cordial endorsement. It was not to be expected that there would be immediate universal acceptance of the Program in its entirety, but the spirit of the criticisms augurs well for the final acceptance of its fundamental principles.

CONTENTS.

	PAGE.
PROCEEDINGS OF THE FIFTH ANNUAL MEETING	I
APPENDIX	50
AN EXAMINATION OF THE PROPOSED MUNICIPAL PROGRAM — <i>Dr. Delos F. Wilcox</i>	51
POLITICAL PARTIES AND CITY GOVERNMENT UNDER THE PROPOSED MUNICIPAL PROGRAM — <i>Prof. Frank J. Goodnow</i>	63
PUBLIC OPINION AND CITY GOVERNMENT UNDER THE PRO- POSED MUNICIPAL PROGRAM— <i>Horace E. Deming</i>	77
A GENERAL VIEW OF THE NEW MUNICIPAL PROGRAM— <i>John A. Butler</i>	87
THE POWER TO INCUR INDEBTEDNESS UNDER THE PROPOSED MUNICIPAL PROGRAM— <i>Hon. Bird S. Coler</i>	96
PUBLIC ACCOUNTING UNDER THE PROPOSED MUNICIPAL PROGRAM— <i>Dr. Leo S. Rowe</i>	104
THE FINANCIAL REPORTS OF MUNICIPALITIES, WITH SPECIAL REFERENCE TO THE REQUIREMENT OF UNIFORMITY— <i>Dr. E. M. Hartwell</i>	124
THE IMPORTANCE OF UNIFORMITY FOR PURPOSES OF COM- PARISON— <i>Dr. Samuel E. Sparling</i>	136
FINANCIAL CONTROL OVER MUNICIPAL RECEIPTS AND EX- PENDITURES— <i>Albert F. Crosby</i>	148
THE ACCOUNTING OF PUBLIC SERVICE INDUSTRIES— <i>Prof. Charles W. Tooke</i>	155
ACCOUNTS OF GRANTEES OF MUNICIPAL FRANCHISES— <i>Wal- ter S. Allen</i>	162

	PAGE.
A YEAR'S ADVANCE— <i>Clinton Rogers Woodruff</i>	169
THE WORK OF THE OHIO MUNICIPAL CODE COMMISSION— <i>Edward Kibler</i>	188
THE WORK OF THE OHIO COMMISSION— <i>Hon. E. J. Blandin</i> ,	199
THE STATUS OF THE PUBLIC SERVICE CORPORATION QUES- TION— <i>Harry A. Garfield</i>	207
CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENTS	216
MUNICIPAL CORPORATIONS ACT	224
BANQUET SPEECHES	250
LIST OF DELEGATES	273
INDEX	275

PROCEEDINGS
OF THE
FIFTH ANNUAL MEETING
OF THE
NATIONAL MUNICIPAL LEAGUE
AND
SEVENTH
National Conference for Good City Government,
HELD AT
COLUMBUS, OHIO, NOVEMBER 15, 16 and 17, 1899.

The Fifth Annual Meeting of the National Municipal League and the Seventh National Conference for Good City Government convened at the Chittenden Hotel, in Columbus, Ohio, and in the absence of the President, the first session was called to order and presided over by First Vice-President Charles Richardson.

The Chair: In the absence of our distinguished President, Mr. Carter, it becomes my duty to ask you to come to order. Before we proceed with the business of the conference of the National Municipal League, I believe that the Honorable Samuel L. Black, of Columbus, has some words for us which we will be glad to hear.

Mr. Black: Gentlemen—Let me assure you that I do not speak the inconsiderate words of compliment, when, in behalf of its Board of Trade, I greet you and extend to you a most cordial welcome to the capital of Ohio. Nowhere throughout the length and breadth of this great sisterhood of States is there a city more deeply concerned in the work which brings you among us, than Columbus. We realize its magnitude; we recognize its difficulties; we are impressed with its serious import to the nation. The story of the solution of the problem of municipal govern-